## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA AT CHARLESTON

IN RE ETHICON, INC., PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327 MDL 2327

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:

ETHICON WAVE 4 CASES LISTED IN EXHIBIT A

JOSEPH R. GOODWIN U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE

## <u>DEFENDANTS' NOTICE OF ADOPTION OF PRIOR DAUBERT RESPONSE OF</u> <u>ELIZABETH KAVALER, M.D. FOR WAVE 4</u>

Plaintiffs filed a Notice of Adoption (ECF No. 3613) in the Wave 4 cases identified in Exhibit A to their Notice, adopting their Motion to Exclude or, in the Alternative, to Limit the Opinions and Testimony of Elizabeth Kavaler, M.D., ECF No. 2005 ("Plaintiffs' Wave 1 Motion"). Defendants hereby adopt and incorporate by reference their prior *Daubert* response in Ethicon Wave 1, Case No. 2:12-md-02327, ECF No. 2165 ("Defendants' Wave 1 Response").

Defendants acknowledge that on August 31, 2016, the Court issued a Memorandum Opinion and Order, ECF No. 2704 (the "Order") GRANTING Plaintiffs' Wave 1 Motion in part, DENYING it in part, and RESERVING judgment in part.

Where the Court DENIED Plaintiffs' Wave 1 Motion, Defendants respectfully request that the Court adopt the same ruling in the Wave 4 cases identified in Exhibit A attached hereto for the reasons set forth in Defendants' Wave 1 Response and the Court's Order.

Where the Court otherwise GRANTED or RESERVED judgment on Plaintiffs' Wave 1 Motion, Defendants acknowledge the Court's ruling, and acknowledge the same circumstances apply in Wave 4, but preserve their right to challenge the ruling on appeal.

Respectfully submitted,

April 27, 2017

/s/ Christy D. Jones

Christy D. Jones Butler Snow LLP 1020 Highland Colony Parkway Suite 1400 (39157) P.O. Box 6010 Ridgeland, MS 39158-6010 (601) 985-4523 christy.jones@butlersnow.com /s/ David B. Thomas

David B. Thomas (W.Va. Bar #3731) Thomas Combs & Spann PLLC 300 Summers Street Suite 1380 (25301) P.O. Box 3824 Charleston, WV 25338 (304) 414-1807 dthomas@tcspllc.com

/s/ Kelly S. Crawford

Kelly S. Crawford Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland & Perretti, LLP Headquarters Plaza One Speedwell Avenue Morristown, NJ 07962-1981 (973) 451-8417 kcrawford@riker.com

COUNSEL FOR DEFENDANTS ETHICON, INC., ETHICON, LLC, AND JOHNSON & JOHNSON

## EXHIBIT A

	WAVE 4 CASE NAME	CASE NO.
1.	Lillian Datz v. Ethicon, Inc., et al.	2:12-cv-03735
2.	Zinaida Stepski v. Ethicon, Inc. et al.	2:12-cv-05342

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on April 27, 2017, I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the court using CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the CM/ECF participants registered to receive service in this MDL.

/s/ Kelly S. Crawford
Kelly S. Crawford